

## Melville's *Typee*, Lawrence's Utopia: Edens to be Escaped From

Miyo Oyama<sup>1</sup>

### Abstract

---

*Typee: A Peep at Polynesian Life*, the first exotic novel by Herman Melville, was held in high esteem by D. H. Lawrence, and critics have already discussed that the two authors both deplored the fallen ways by which the soul and civilisation of the white races were bound, and were seeking a place in which bodily experiences could replace the mental orientation of their societies. However, this paper will reveal the deeper ideas they have in common which lie in Lawrence's positive and negative critical assessments of Melville in *Studies in Classic American Literature*. It will also highlight the parallels between the utopian life in *Typee* and Lawrence's unfinished story 'A Dream of Life', which depicts a resuscitation of society in a futuristic, though primitive paradise. Lawrence himself often emphasised the risk of the exclusivity of the utopianised islands in his works, and it is for this reason that he values Melville's evocation of the limitations which the island has for his narrator. This paper will discuss the extent to which the primitive island was a significant horizon for the two authors by analysing *Typee* in relation to Lawrence's ideas.

---

**Keywords:** *Typee*, Herman Melville, D. H. Lawrence, primitiveness, community

### 1. Introduction

It is well known that the high esteem for Herman Melville expressed in *Studies in Classic American Literature* (1923) by D. H. Lawrence contributed to the Melville revival in the early twentieth century. Melville was unique in his challenging way of depicting his characters' unconscious relation to the physical world, although he is counted as one of the nineteenth-century American Renaissance novelists with the age of the supremacy of mind in their backgrounds. It is clear, for example, from his depiction of the characters risking their lives almost beyond any imaginable determination to kill the white whale, which Lawrence regards as a representation of the lost vitality of the body in human beings. Lawrence 'shows that Melville was drawn to the physical side of man which his "white psyche" had suppressed' (Banerjee, 2011: 472), and he never ignored Melville's uniqueness along with his eye for the aesthetics of the body. Lawrence deplored the corruption of the white men's souls and their civilisation and insisted on the revival of 'blood consciousness', which is his philosophy of the deep unconscious intimacy between human beings that is not bound by reason or mind. Therefore he reacted intensely to the germ of his own thoughts which he found in Melville, which involves an inclination towards primitive life and also a critical awareness about it.

Lawrence expressed particular esteem for the literary qualities of *Typee: A Peep at Polynesian Life* (1846), and 'Most modern *Typee* interpretations are still on the lines of D. H. Lawrence, who expounds that the book shows Melville's aspiration for a primitive Eden and his final repudiation of it, for, Lawrence says, he finds the return to the past impossible and unbearable' (Hirano, 2006: 95). As Harumi Hirano notes, the fact that Lawrence focuses on the limits of Melville's primitivist aspiration has attracted critics' attention — that is, the meaning of the protagonist's forsaking his life on the island of Nukuheva and attempting an escape. There is a lot of criticism which examines the issues of why Tommo, the narrator of *Typee*, could not entirely accept the Marquesas Island and its people, and why he had to forsake them. Their speculations can be divided into the following three types: (1) The primitive life was not in fact bearable to the American man as a representative of the modern society and culture. (2) Eventually it turned out that it was intolerable for him to undergo a conversion through the tattooing of his face. (3) His decision to leave was due to his intense suspicion and fear of the custom of cannibalism, even though it is not revealed whether it really exists on the island or not.

---

<sup>1</sup> Master's student at English Literature, School of English, University of Nottingham, Great Britain. E-mail: [menyayasukiyo@gmail.com](mailto:menyayasukiyo@gmail.com).

Although they all seem reasonable, these interpretations are insufficient to explain the reason why Lawrence focused on the issue and was attracted to it. One topic that has not been fully discussed is the way in which Lawrence's attachment to utopia suggests both his appraisal and his criticism of Melville: the utopia involves the ideal of a way of life which stimulates the awakening of the 'blood consciousness' of white people, and on the other hand, it involves his contrasting, negative view of the exclusiveness of the space of the island and also an ideology of primitivism. Regarding the analysis of *Typee*, this paper focuses on the viewpoint underlying Lawrence's idea and examines why the island space, remote from any civilised continent, had a magnetism for both writers as an Eden, and simultaneously was a perilous place to be escaped from.

## 2. The Indivisibility of Advancement and Retrogression in the American Ideology

From Lawrence's reading of Melville, it has already been recognised that there are many similarities between their ideas. Melville describes the adventures of characters who board ships for whaling or foreign trade and then go on to seek for something beyond the aims of business or commerce. While the characters represent Americans who are driven by the frontier spirit which seeks to enlarge one's land, their actions raise the question of why they are unable to remain in the same place. As for the perspective of time, evolution, and development, Hisao Tanaka (2004: 76) argues that Melville was rebellious towards the chronological time scheme which is the master narrative of American society constituted by the uniformity of the Protestant religious framework. As Tanaka argues, the 'trust in the linear movement of time which is in harmony with the growth of civilization has been a curse as well as a blessing' (2004: 78), and I consider that Melville and Lawrence have most in common in relation to this topic. Lawrence calls the disposition of the Americans' abhorrence for retreat 'The doom of our white day' (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 146), and he claims that Melville knew that the white men's souls were destined for it. Lawrence perceives that the Americans' destiny of advance and the irony of their panic about the deed are represented in the following description in *Moby-Dick* (1851): 'The reversion. "Not so much bound to any haven ahead, as rushing from all havens astern." That great horror of ours! It is our civilisation rushing from all havens astern' (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 146). It might be a sense of fear of American civilisation turning to a mental vacuity, leaving their substantial body behind. Now that America has come so far from the first step of growing out from England, it should have a sense of forlornness about being unable to settle down to the motherland. L. D. Clark argues that 'In appearance the Puritans had succeeded, establishing a "perfect mechanical concord" which purported to unite Americans in democratic brotherhood but which came down to a "negative, destructive form of oneness". They had failed because the dusky spirit of the continent would not be denied. Slowly it permeated the American soul, awaiting the moment to burgeon. All classic American literature Lawrence saw as prophetic of this process' (1989: 195). Due to this reaction, Americans have manifested a failure of reconciliation with the place in terms of their incapacity for establishing unity on the continent. It is reflected in the philosophical experience described in *Moby-Dick*, by which Lawrence is strongly impressed, which expresses the astonishing reversal of a sense of direction on the sea.

... suddenly he feels the ship rushing backward from him, in mystic reversion. — 'Uppermost was the impression, that whatever swift, rushing thing I stood on was not so much bound to any haven ahead, as rushing from all havens astern. A stark, bewildered feeling, as of death, came over me. Convulsively my hands grasped the tiller, but with the crazy conceit that the tiller was, somehow, in some enchanted way, inverted. "My God! What is the matter with me!" thought I! —'

This dream-experience is a real soul-experience. (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 143)

Lawrence sees through the malaise of the indivisibility of the exploitative advancement and a subconscious yearning for retrogression which Melville's sea novels involve. This is exactly Lawrence's favourite topic: the bodily experience, in which the intuition through one's body reveals a subconscious truth which transcends mental cognition. Surprisingly, it is not very often discussed that this quotation reveals the community of the two writers' ideas. Lawrence himself had an interest in islands as an escape from the disorder of British society amid war, and wrote several tales which deal with the insulation of islands. Even if they were not geographical islands, he was searching for 'mental islands as images of withdrawal' (Franks, 2006: 105) or 'metaphorical islands or utopian sites' (Michelucci, 2015: paragraph 5). However, Melville's actual experience as a mariner, which enabled him to vividly describe the living experience of the sea by modelling it after the retreat from civilisation, must have admirably assisted his creative insight from Lawrence's point of view.

### 3. The Unmanned Narrator: The Re-birth Myth of Utopia

It is the primitive life on the island in *Typee* which awaits Tommo after the backward experience of travelling from the continent of America. By making the character land on the South Sea island, Melville suggested that there exists a paradise of the preserved past for those human beings who are far gone in the civilised world.<sup>2</sup> Hirano comments that the idea of eighteenth-century primitivists, which Rousseau supported, was that the oldest and most undeveloped stage of society in history was the best: 'Men were innocent and perfect in their morality. History since then is the succession of degeneration from this remotest ideal model' (2006: 97). Lawrence argues that Tommo's 'pure-mystical' incident of being thrown back from this world to the world before the depravity is an experience of regeneration: 'Down this narrow, steep, horrible dark gorge he slides and struggles as we struggle in a dream, or in the act of birth, to emerge in the green Eden of the Golden Age, the valley of the cannibal savages. This is a bit of birth-myth, or re-birth myth, on Melville's part —' (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 125). Tommo goes through rebirth in the Eden of Typee valley. On the first night after escaping from the ship with Toby, he feels that 'the accumulated horrors of that night, the death-like coldness of the place, the appalling darkness and the dismal sense of our forlorn condition, almost unmanned [him]' (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 46). The word 'unmanned' used here is a key. The regeneration in Typee after losing his sophisticated manliness due to the severe environment enabled Tommo to be implanted with a new life beginning from the level of his physical resurrection. In the first part of his criticism of Melville, Lawrence repeatedly emphasises that Melville had a distaste for the 'people with blue eyes' that is, for the 'humanness' of the white men, and that he devoted all his strength to escaping from the 'humanness' with the purpose of going back to the world of nature (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 122). This kind of abstractness of Lawrence's critical language about Melville, with its sharp and powerful tone, tends to be regarded as containing ambiguities; however, more ideological similarities between the two authors are implied in the language than the critics have traced. In his own works, Lawrence was also straining to escape from the lives of civilised men who have intensified their mind-orientedness. He also used the word 'inhuman' favourably to describe the way in which the physical consciousness, which modernised people have left far behind them, could be resuscitated.

Lawrence writes that the Pacific sea is an old sea which 'has not come to any modern consciousness', and the native people living there have been soundly sleeping instead of being awakened to the new consciousness (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 123). Reading his ideas from his words, Lawrence should have presumed from Melville's manner of writing that the new consciousness is a civilised mental consciousness which keeps on renewing itself. On the other hand, Polynesian natives retain the 'blood consciousness' which Lawrence regarded as the origin of human beings: with no intervention of mind, one can have a dynamic and organic connection with other people and one's surroundings. 'The heart of the Pacific seems like a vast vacuum, in which, mirage-like, continues the life of myriads of ages back. . . . The Pacific Ocean holds the dream of immemorial centuries. . . . To this phantom Melville returned. Back, back, away from life' (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 124; my emphasis). The two novelists obviously share the idea that the inhuman life with physical consciousness still remains in the dream-like past world.

### 4. Similar Aspects of Communities in *Typee* and 'A Dream of Life'

This critical attitude of Lawrence, I would suggest, calls to mind his unfinished short story, 'A Dream of Life' (1927).<sup>3</sup> This story goes by the name of Science Fiction and presents an unreal and crooked worldview: nonetheless, we see too much abundance of suggestion to make a judgement that this story is not worth criticising due to its incompleteness.<sup>4</sup> Moreover, although I find no study which compares this narrative with Melville's, this utopian story shows one of the attitudes of Lawrence reading Melville.

'We are such stuff as our grandmothers' dreams are made on' ('A Dream of Life', [1927] 2018: 24) — repeating this impressive phrase, the tale begins with the main character's unaffected but philosophical narrative. One day, he returns to his home in the Midlands in England and he describes the contemporary world as the outcome of realising the wishes and invocations of people, who lived two generations ago, for the world to become better:

<sup>2</sup> Koichi Nakamura argues that we can see that the 'last myth of the Americans upon the idea of Typee valley regards it as equivalent to paradise: the Americans who failed to see the nation of America itself as "a promised land" and "a new paradise" and try to set up the Pacific island as a substitute for it situated farther to the west' (1991: 14; my translation).

<sup>3</sup> The quotations from 'A Dream of Life' in this paper are from the latest text which is edited by Hiroshi Muto. Since errors were found in the text which appears in the Cambridge edition of *Late Essays and Articles*, the accurate and most recent text revised by Muto was published in *The Journal of D. H. Lawrence Studies* in 2018.

<sup>4</sup> 'Science Fiction' is the term which Muto uses in the Japanese translation of this piece.

That is, ‘the grandmothers’ dreams’. The world has become the reincarnation of the consciousness of successive generations. However, the main character is tired of such a world which is obsessed with fulfilling the forefathers’ ghostly wills. He misses the coal mines which had been operated by human power, not machines, and he has a daydream of returning to the past world that never comes back, as in his childhood he fancied that the squares of miners’ dwellings were the walls of the golden city of Jerusalem. Hoping that “‘for a little while I am safe and sound, and the vulgar world doesn’t exist for me’” (‘A Dream of Life’, [1927] 2018: 30), he falls asleep in a cave; and the tale undergoes a sudden shift whereby he has been sent to the world of 2927 when he wakes up: a thousand years after he actually lived. He finds himself in an unfamiliar condition due to losing the sense of his four limbs and goes through an experience of regeneration.<sup>5</sup> He begins to remember his human-like feeling for language through his physical sensations under the fuzzy consciousness. He intuits that the world has turned into what he dreamed of, and later he recognises that it is specifically a future world, despite the naked people and their ancient Egyptian appearance, and the architecture and the old-fashioned agricultural life they have. Lawrence’s utopia spreads like a seamless dreamy world with the protagonist’s doze, and here we find the affinity of the two novelists — they both considered that the physical unity and the relationship of co-existence still remain in the lives of non-Western peoples, though people in England or America have lost them in the process of their civilisation and evangelisation. The south-Pacific race which Melville depicts have neither material wealth nor technical development and live an extremely undeveloped life. However, they do not have a class-divided society and the political conflicts which follow from it. Tommo confirms his admiration of the ‘the unanimity of feeling’ (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 203), the harmony of the fraternal love which envelops the world with no disagreements: ‘They showed this spirit of unanimity in every action of life: every thing was done in concert and good fellowship’ (203).

The natives appeared to form one household, whose members were bound together by the ties of strong affection. The love of kindred I did not so much perceive, for it seemed blended in the general love; and where all were treated as brothers and sisters, it was hard to tell who were actually related to each other by blood. (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 204)

The world in which people ‘live without benefit of laws, judges or jails’, is a role model for the modernised society characterised by economic inequality. Gorman Beauchamp argues that therefore ‘the indiscernible concord, the oneness of view that characterizes their society, constitutes the goal of *all* utopian models, whether reconstructive or escapist’ (1981: 11), and it is often figured into utopian sites and appears in literary texts. However, I would suggest that the mystical life of the community integrated by physical harmony, and surrounded by an instinct of brotherly friendship, corresponds to the subtle interaction through blood consciousness which Lawrence idealises: a world without interference from the friction of language and minds. ‘There was a great stillness in the world, and yet a magic of close-interwoven life’ (‘A Dream of Life’, [1927] 2018: 36) in the people of the town of Nethrupp (which is a fabricated name for Newthorpe). For the protagonist who is recovering his physical sensations one by one, ‘It was as if the deepest instinct had been cultivated in the people, to be comely. The soft, quiet comeliness was like a dream, a dream of life at last come true’ (‘A Dream of Life’, [1927] 2018: 40-41). Although it is not stated directly, it is obvious that the past which the man had dreamed of returning to was a world of no dissonance, filled with blood consciousness. On the other hand, he notices the inhuman quality in the Nethrupps:

I was afraid: afraid for myself. These people, it seemed to me, were not people, not human beings in my sense of the word. They had the stillness and the completeness of plants. And see how they could melt into one amazing instinctive thing, a human flock of motion. (‘A Dream of Life’, [1927] 2018: 39-40)

He becomes enchanted by their completeness, contrasting with his own incompleteness: ‘That was the quality of all the people: an inner stillness and ease, like plants that come to flower and fruit. The individual was like a whole fruit, body and mind and spirit, without split’ (‘A Dream of Life’, [1927] 2018: 36). Therefore, the modernised people are depicted as incomplete and fragmented, whereas the inhuman people are ripened and have a quality of wholeness analogous to that of nature. Their absoluteness has nothing to do with material repletion: however, the satisfactory quality of their togetherness makes the modernised human beings feel the separation of their minds from their bodies as one of the predicaments of the society.

---

<sup>5</sup> The way the main character has been washed his body by the people of Nethrupp as if he is baptised, it represents a ceremonial for regeneration as well as Tommo has been washed by the native people in *Typee*.

As it is expressed in *Typee*, the narrator finds that ‘the heart burnings, the jealousies, the social rivalries, the family dissensions, and the thousand self-inflicted discomforts of refined life, which make up in units the swelling aggregate of human misery’ ([1846] 1968: 124-25) are the price of obtaining civilisation, and the feelings of the narrator in ‘A Dream of Life’ are thus not far from Tommo’s feelings for the Typees. It is similar when Tommo is attracted to the innocent joyfulness of the people and the continual happiness which prevails in the valley (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 127), which is a primitive richness that originates from their physicality.

In both narratives we see the yearning for the sacred unity of blood consciousness, in lieu of the mental piety of Christianity,<sup>6</sup> and the narrator’s feeling for the inhuman completeness of the people in the past, as it seems (though in fact it is the future), in Lawrence’s utopia parallels with that of Tommo when he compares Typees with white people. However, Lawrence does not particularly refer to this common feature in his review of Melville’s writings and this is because the subsequent act of breaking away from the valley of Typee can be considered as implying the collapse of the idealised wholeness. In the next part of the essay I will discuss what reasons can be found for the two novelists’ secession from the ideal of complete stillness.

### 5. Incompatibilities of Community and Individuality in Melville and Lawrence

Tommo loves his savage hosts, though he could not yield himself to the harmony of their world and had to resist their cordial reception. In terms of his doubleness, Mitchell Breitwieser argues that ‘This indecisiveness is not primarily a quirk of Tommo’s psyche. Rather, Tommo is a register of a social contradiction within the meaning of *America*’ (1982: 401). Breitwieser likens Tommo to the nineteenth-century figure of the human being which Karl Marx assumed, who is a communal being in the political community, though a private individual in civil society. Tommo in Typee is ‘the imaginary member of an imaginary sovereignty, divested of his real, individual life and infused with an unreal universality’, and his ‘abstract, ideal liberal state’ is ‘maintained . . . by floating above actual social divisions’ (Breitwieser, 1982: 402). However, he has a materialistic sensibility when he is in civil society as a member of the crew of the ship, and therefore, Breitwieser considers that the contradictory quality in Tommo’s character which expresses nineteenth-century capitalist society leads him into a disunion.

In addition, I would argue that an anxiety related to stillness in life is the probable reason for Tommo’s dilemma. Tommo has suffered from a pain in his leg from an unknown cause since he landed on Typee. His legs get disabled and strike him with a severe pain, once he starts to have suspicion or fear toward Typees whom he labels as man-eating people: the pain is a symbol of his distrust. On the other hand, as we see in the seventeenth chapter, when the suspicion evaporates from Tommo’s mind and when he is moved by the fullness of their world, his legs curiously recover and he can walk around by himself. As Lawrence presumes the white whale to be a representation of the lost physicality of the Americans, the community of the Typees symbolises the same thing, since Tommo’s physical pain is healed by the organic oneness with them. He becomes released from his civilised thoughts and is allowed to be free from the ache, when he is temporarily absorbed into the uniformity of the Typees and their rich physicality.

However, when he has recovered from the pain, Tommo becomes aware of the senselessness in himself, saying that ‘Gradually I lost all knowledge of the regular recurrence of the days of the week, and sunk insensibly into that kind of apathy which ensues after some violent outbreak of despair’ (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 123); and this is what Lawrence suggests as a perilous sign of one’s diminishing consciousness in his island pieces. Lawrence depicts the same disposition of human beings distinctly in his novel *The Trespasser* (1914) and his short story ‘The Man Who Loved Islands’ (1927). While enjoying the unity with nature and losing daily consciousness of time, which Lawrence depicts as states of consciousness that characterise the closed space of islands, the characters show an inclination toward a lethargic condition of both mind and body by losing enthusiasm for being involved with or having conflicts with other people. This highlights the alarming implications of the situation for human beings, since the endings of both pieces depict the solitary deaths of the main characters who avoid every means of communication with other people and fall into a callous stupor. Frederick Karl argues that Cathcart, the narrator of ‘The Man Who Loved Islands’, shows a ‘type of passivity [that] destroys the individual himself’ (1992: 444) and that the last scene in which the island to which he escaped is covered with snow, ‘nullifies his existence and buries him in a tomb of endless desirelessness’ (1992: 443).

---

<sup>6</sup> The Typees had a concept of piety in fact by submitting to ‘Taboo’ which has all-controlling sacred power on them, which is not only literal taboo but also has talismanic effects. However, Tommo decisively describes that it was unable for him to comprehend its formula.

While Lawrence yearned for a society which realises an organic unity with others, he also suggested the inevitability of the gaps and conflicts in life between individuals, and therefore considered that an inactive world which lacks dynamic interactions is also inhuman. The conclusion of 'A Dream of Life' can be never known; however, one cannot imagine the narrator's full absorption into the Nethrupp world from the emphasis on his solitude and discomfort along with his admiration of unity. Lawrence himself insists through his works that utopia can turn into dystopia, because we cannot remain separate from society indefinitely.

## 6. Being Unmanned Again: Escaping from a World with No Contests

Returning to *Typee*, Tommo's doubt about the Typees' custom of cannibalism increases again. The contradictory image of the Typees, who are both idealised and feared, is only a projection of Tommo's conflicting views, and it can be considered that he creates a disturbing terror by himself in order to confirm his heterogeneity as a civilised man who cannot be a member of their unified society.<sup>7</sup> Again, he is unconsciously creating a strong reaction, represented by the pain in his leg, urging himself to be suspicious of the Typee people in order to regain his identity and sense. Before he puts the escape from the valley into practice, he is increasingly haunted by an emotional hollowness. He feels that the dumb birds on the island commiserate with and plant melancholy in him, who remains a stranger, and he finds himself cast out from the unity of the people or nature on the island: "There was no one with whom I could freely converse; no one to whom I could communicate my thoughts; no one who could sympathise with my sufferings" (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 231). Being increasingly obsessed with the thought that he is merely deceived by their warm hospitality, Tommo vents his fear by saying, "This added calamity nearly unmanned me" (*Typee*, [1846] 1968: 232). The word 'unmanned' symbolically appears here for the second time, and seems to represent more than a feeling of losing his mind. Although he had once been unmanned, baptised and reborn, he could not accept the ease of the Eden and is harmed by the influence which his intelligence has on his mentality. Eventually, he is tortured by the pain of returning to the human world from the inhuman world once again.

In the last part of the Typee/Omoo chapter of *Studies in Classic American Literature*, Lawrence poignantly writes that Melville was defeated by his own belief that "The world *ought* to be a harmonious loving place" (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 132), and discovered its impracticability. It suggests that Melville did not ultimately idealise a world free from the contest between individual lives, and also that both Lawrence and Melville concluded that utopian completeness is not what we should be fully absorbed in. On the other hand, Lawrence himself thinks that "The world *ought not* to be a harmonious loving place. It ought to be a place of fierce discord and intermittent harmonies: which it is" (*Studies*, [1923] 2003: 132). Lawrence paid respect to the difference between living things — his idea was to achieve an organic coexistence through the dynamic process of continuously creating free conflicts and discords, and also creating a harmony between living things. Tommo marvelled at, admired, feared, and sometimes disdained the idle life of the natives who do not even know how to cultivate lands for farming. However, he could not really reduce the mental and physical distance between himself and them, and the relationship between the races in *Typee* does not involve the dialectical development of their consciousness that would result from challenging and exploring each other's differences. Seeking an escape from America, Tommo encounters the primitive utopia in the past of man's life: however, being unable to confront the difference, he ended with no more than the position of a spectator, which the subtitle of the book testifies to — that is, 'a peep at Polynesian Life'. He makes another escape from Typee and barely succeeds in retaining his autonomy and instinct for life by keeping on moving.

## 7. Conclusion

This paper has examined the positives and negatives in Lawrence's criticism for *Typee* and of its author, Melville, and revealed both novelists' gesture towards the ideal primitive society. Although so little research exists comparing the novel with the utopian mode in 'A Dream of Life', the idealised communities in both pieces similarly express a longing for the wholeness constituted by physical consciousness. However, Lawrence's literary utopia did not develop further as a practical concept and his mistrust of utopia lies in the background of his focus on the escape of Tommo, who has extricated himself due to his fear of the loss of his identity.

---

<sup>7</sup> Claudia Morrison argues that Lawrence sees that Melville was a writer who constantly finds comfort in stimulation or discomfort. "With sharp perception, Lawrence pointed out that Melville was by nature a man in revolt, one who was least comfortable when surrounded by comfort: "When he had something definite to rebel against — like the bad conditions on a whaling ship — then he was much happier in his miseries. The mills of God were grinding inside him, and he needed something to grind on" (Morrison, 1992: 301).

While the wholeness can be attained by escaping from the humanity of the modernised society, being absorbed into the placid world of inhumanity can involve a danger of losing one's autonomy as an individual, and also one's respect for the gulf between others and the desire to challenge it.

Although the two novelists had similar concerns, they were different in the ways in which they developed the issue. Melville's unique experiences on the sea and the islands were epoch-making in the period, as Lawrence judged, though the prospect which he sought was different from that which Melville pursued. In his later post-colonial works, Lawrence assiduously pursued a balance between the yearning for wholeness on the one hand, and compromising with the individual ego on the other, by maintaining both mental and physical consciousness. While Lawrence gives his utopian island tales tragic dead ends, the limitations of the island utopia are re-examined by his post-colonial works, and he continued to explore them by dealing with the themes of individuality and racial conflicts. In conclusion, *Typee* presents a significant textual horizon as a utopia, in relation to which the two novelists in nineteenth-century America and twentieth-century England intersect, as well as showing the point of divergence between them as they grappled with the ordeals which their physical experiences represented for their modernised white narrators.

## References

- Banerjee, A. (2011). 'D. H. Lawrence's Discovery of American Literature.' *The Sewanee Review*, 119 (3), 469-475. <https://doi.org/10.1353/sew.2011.0068>
- Beauchamp, G. (1981). 'Melville and the Tradition of Primitive Utopia.' *The Journal of General Education*, 33 (1), 6-14.
- Breitwieser, M. (1982). 'False Sympathy in Melville's *Typee*.' *American Quarterly*, 34 (4), 396-417. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2712689>
- Clark, L. D. (1989). 'Making the Classic Contemporary: Lawrence's Pilgrimage Novels and American Romance.' In P. Preston, & P. Hoare (Eds.), *D. H. Lawrence in the Modern World* (pp. 193-216). Macmillan P Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-349-09848-4>
- Franks, J. (2006). *Islands and the Modernists*. McFarland & Company, Inc.
- Hirano, H. (2006). 'Melville's Quest for Art in *Typee*.' *Studies of Human Science*, 2, 95-111.
- Karl, F. R. (1992). 'Lawrence's "The Man Who Loved Islands": The Crusoe Who Failed.' In D. Ellis & O. De Zordo (Eds.), *D. H. Lawrence Critical Assessments*, III. Helm Information Ltd.
- Lawrence, D. H. (2003). E. Greenspan, L. Vasey, & J. Worthen (Eds.), *Studies in Classic American Literature*. Cambridge UP.
- . (2018). 'A New Edition of D. H. Lawrence's "[Autobiographical Fragment (A Dream of Life)]"?' Hiroshi Muto (Ed.), *Journal of D. H. Lawrence Studies*, 5 (1), 11-58.
- Melville, H. (1968). *Typee; A Peep at Polynesian Life*. (The Northwestern-Newberry ed.). Northwestern UP & The Newberry Library.
- Michelucci, S. (2015). 'D. H. Lawrence's (Un)happy Islands.' *Études Lawrenciennes*, 46. <https://doi.org/10.4000/lawrence.240>
- Morrison, C. (1992). 'D. H. Lawrence and American Literature.' In D. Ellis & O. De Zordo (Eds.), *D. H. Lawrence Critical Assessments*, IV. Helm Information Ltd.
- Nakamura, K. (1991). *Melville no Kataritetchi (Narrators in Melville)*. Rinsensyoten.
- Tanaka, H. (2004). 'Modes of "Different" Time in American Literature.' *The Japanese Journal of American Studies*, 15, 75-95.